



GRUPO DE TRABAJO CONJUNTO DE CUMBRES (GTCC)
JOINT SUMMIT WORKING GROUP (JSWG)

OEA/Ser.E
GTCC/doc.2/08
December 2008
Original: English

Comments submitted by the Joint Summit Working Group
Regarding the Draft Declaration of Commitment of Port of Spain
[Versions: Original and Rev. 1]

JOINT SUMMIT WORKING GROUP (JSWG)
OAS-IDB-ECLAC-PAHO-WB-IICA-CABEI-CAF-CDB-IOM-ILO-IDRC/ICA
GRUPO DE TRABAJO CONJUNTO DE CUMBRES (GTCC)
OEA-BID-CEPAL-OPS-BM-IICA-BCIE-CAF-BDC-OIM-OIT- IDRC/ICA

Secretaría de Cumbres de las Américas – Summits of the Americas Secretariat

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTORY NOTE	2
I. COMMENTS OF THE ORGANIZATION OF AMERICAN STATES (OAS)	3
II. COMMENTS OF THE INTER-AMERICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK (IDB) ..	11
III. COMMENTS OF THE ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN (ECLAC)	14
IV. COMMENTS OF THE PAN AMERICAN HEALTH ORGANIZATION (PAHO)	17
V. COMMENTS OF THE WORLD BANK	22
VI. COMMENTS OF THE INTER-AMERICAN INSTITUTE FOR COOPERATION ON AGRICULTURE (IICA)	23
VII. COMMENTS OF THE INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATION FOR MIGRATION (IOM)	29
VIII. COMMENTS OF THE INTERNATIONAL LABOR ORGANIZATION (ILO)	30
IX. COMMENTS OF THE INSTITUTE FOR CONNECTIVITY IN THE AMERICAS (ICA)	33

INTRODUCTORY NOTE

In its role to provide technical support to the Summit of the Americas process, the institutional partners of the Joint Summit Working Group (JSWG) have provided comments and observations on the proposed text of the draft Declaration of Commitment of Port of Spain for the consideration of the OAS Member States in their negotiation of the primary document of the Fifth Summit of the Americas.

In its capacity as the Chair of the JSWG, the OAS/GS (Summits of the Americas Secretariat) has prepared this document, which presents a verbatim compilation of the comments received from the JSWG institutions on the Original and Revision 1 versions of the draft Declaration of Commitment. Paragraphs may be noted as either (Original) or (Rev 1) throughout this document to clarify to which version of the draft comments were originally proposed.

I. COMMENTS OF THE ORGANIZATION OF AMERICAN STATES (OAS)

Paragraph 2 (Rev 1):

The OAS Charter should be listed first.

Paragraph 4 (Rev 1):

There is no mention of environmental sustainability as a core challenge facing the people of the hemisphere. If the intention of this paragraph is to set up the rest of the document then this omission must be corrected

Paragraph 5 (Original):

We are mindful that deep and persistent inequalities continue to exist, especially in education, income levels, health and nutritional status, exposure to violence and crime, and access to basic services. ~~In response, we will continue to develop and implement~~ We pledge to speed up the design and implementation of sound social protection programmes that are specifically targeted to the poor and vulnerable groups in our societies, in order to ensure equal access for all men and women to basic social services such as water, housing, healthcare, food and sanitation.

Paragraph 5 (Rev 1):

This paragraph is missing the sustainable development dimension. While there is reference to access to safe drinking water and disease prevention, as goals, there is no mention of access to land, neither is there reference to some of the broader aspects of environmental sustainability which impinge on human prosperity. Since the paragraph addresses the needs of the poor and vulnerable and there is a linkage between these conditions and environmental degradation, actions related to environmental protection should be included.

Paragraph 6 (Original):

Clarity is required as to what this consolidation will entail and given that not all Caribbean countries are members of the IADB, the Caribbean Development Bank and the IADB should be asked to jointly review existing programs, etc.

NEW PARAGRAPH A (Rev 1):

The Draft ought to recognize the interrelatedness of the thematic areas and promote an integrated approach to governance; hence the call should be for Ministers with responsibility for Finance, Planning, Social Development *and Environmental Management* to review and consolidate...

Paragraph 7 (Original)

We recognize that to eliminate poverty and hunger, create jobs, and raise the standard of living of all our people, we must achieve higher levels of ~~continuous-sustained~~ economic growth with equity. We also recognize the positive contribution ~~of that~~ open trade policies can make to in the promotion of growth, employment and development. We, therefore, commit to continue implementing sound macro-economic policies that ~~are characterized by include appropriate and~~ transparent fiscal and monetary measures, prudent public expenditures, and higher domestic savings and high growth rates. We will also continue to promote private sector development, diversify economic activity, improve competitiveness and strengthen economic integration, ~~We are committed to~~ boosting investment in energy, transport and

communications infrastructure to attract additional private investment and promote business development.

High growth rates are already mentioned in the early part of the sentence and can be deleted here without injury to the text. Additionally, it should be noted that high growth rates are not always an outcome of sound macro-economic policies and programs

Paragraph 7 (Rev 1):

In the proposed actions to raise the standards of living in these paragraph efforts to improve environmental management should be included as this has been previously defined by the Summit Process as an important condition for human well being and economic prosperity. Overall this section of the draft declaration fails to recognize the relationship between economic growth and environmental sustainability.

Paragraph 8 (Original):

In accordance with the Decent Work in the Americas: An Agenda for the Hemisphere (2006-2015), we will continue to facilitate and encourage ~~the creation of~~ more decent and productive employment opportunities in the formal sector. We instruct the Ministers of Labour, within the context of the OAS Inter-American Conference of Ministers of Labour, in collaboration with the unions and the employers' organizations and with the support of the International Labour Organisation (ILO), to develop a coordinated plan to continue to address the objectives of the Agenda by the end of 2010.

Paragraph 9 (Original):

With the support of the ILO and in accordance with the Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work, we will adopt the necessary policies and regulations to facilitate and promote the establishment of enterprises and the movement of ~~enterprises and~~ workers from the informal to the formal sector. We also reaffirm that all migrants regardless of their immigration status, should be accorded the full protection of human rights and ~~the full observance of~~ labour laws applicable to them.

Paragraph 9 (Rev 1):

The Caribbean Development Bank has been playing a critical role in social development in the region and should be mentioned in this and other paragraphs where banking institutions are mentioned. Further the bank is the premiere development bank in the Caribbean and mention of it will convey recognition of this role in a conference that is being hosted in the Caribbean.

Paragraph 11 (Rev 1):

This paragraph should reflect the concept of sustainable financing given the intensity of the environmental impact of some SME's in the region.

Paragraph 13 (Original):

Presumably these laws will be WTO-compatible. As now worded this suggests the supplanting of the role of the WTO and existing rules.

Paragraph 14 (Original):

Feeding our people is ~~now~~ the most immediate challenge confronting our Hemisphere and, indeed, the world. We, therefore, commit to taking an active role, working in partnership with

the international community, to develop and implement comprehensive policies and programmes to resolve this challenge. We reaffirm our commitment to the 2008 Rome Declaration on World Food Security, to the objectives of the World Food Summit and to the Millennium Development Goal to halve the number of undernourished people by 2015.

Paragraph 14 (Rev 1):

Sustainable production should be mentioned as a means to achieve adequate supplies of healthy foods.

Paragraph 15 (Rev 1):

In addition to approaches under the Agro 2003-2015 plan reference could be made here to the commitments in the PIDS and the Santa Cruz +10 Declaration on Sustainable Agriculture. Also reference should be made to the importance of effective land use policies and plans to ensure that land availability does not pose and threat to food security.

Paragraph 17 (Original):

While ~~the region has made~~ strides **have been made** in reducing mortality in infants and children under 5 years, **in our Hemisphere**, neonatal mortality has not decreased at the same rate. We call on the Pan American Health Organisation (PAHO) to continue to assist countries in addressing this problem through the implementation of the Regional Strategic Plan of Action based on the Interagency Strategic Consensus on Reducing Neonatal Mortality and Morbidity in Latin America and the Caribbean.

Paragraph 18 (Rev 1):

This paragraph could also reiterate support to the Health and Environment initiative given the mentioned environmental health challenges referred to herein and in paragraph 22. Here a link should be made to diseases linked to deterioration of the environment and to climate-induced diseases.

Paragraph 19 (Rev 1):

Surveillance systems for communicable diseases also need to be improved.

NEW PARAGRAPH C:

Threats are posed also by abuse of legal drugs and psychotropic substances.

Paragraph 20 (Rev 1):

A link should be made in this paragraph to diseases that are associated with a deterioration of the health of the environment.

Paragraph 23 (Original):

We are committed to the goal of halting and reversing the spread of HIV/AIDS and other Sexually Transmitted Infections (STIs) by 2015 by **amongst other things**, providing universal access for men and women to prevention, care, treatment and support. We will implement a regional strategy to provide such access under the coordination of the WHO and PAHO. We also commit to reducing the incidence of mother-to-child transmission of HIV to less than 5% by 2015. We reiterate our commitment to strengthening and providing adequate financing to the Global Fund to Combat AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria.

Paragraph 24 (Rev 1):

Improving early childhood care and education at all levels (primary, secondary and tertiary) and providing continuous training are essential approaches to achieving universal education *and human prosperity*.

Concluding Remark on Education The draft does not reflect any recognition of the important contribution that science and technology development can make to the attainment of human prosperity, energy security and environmental sustainability. This is a serious omission that must be addressed.

Paragraph 26 (Original):

Recognising that education is a lifelong process that promotes social inclusion and allows people to contribute more fully to their societies, we give high priority to improving the quality of, and access to, tertiary, vocational and adult education, especially for women, rural inhabitants, persons with disabilities, Afro-descendants and indigenous peoples. We, therefore, commit to increasing the tertiary participation rate to a minimum of 40 per cent by 2020, and urge countries which have already made considerable advances in this area, to support the efforts of other countries to achieve this target by exchanging good practices ~~that will support the the efforts of other countries to achieve this target~~. We also commit to support the ongoing professional development of teachers.

Paragraph 28 (Original):

Suggested new text:

We recognize that the benefits of the Knowledge-based society must reach every citizen of the Americas. We therefore renew our commitments under the Agenda for Connectivity in the Americas, the Plan of Action of Quito and the Tunis Commitment to ensure the advancement of information and communication technologies as a cross-cutting tool to accelerate the achievement of human prosperity, environmental sustainability and good governance. We instruct our Ministers and High Level Authorities with responsibility for Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) to promote the use of ICTs in all areas where they can improve the quality of life of our citizens and the functioning of our societies.

Paragraph 29 (Original):

We recognise that inter-cultural dialogue and respect for cultural diversity promote mutual understanding and convergence, which help reduce conflict, discrimination and ~~the remove~~ barriers to economic opportunity and social participation. We commit to nurturing creativity and promoting cultural industries as part of our policies for the promotion of social development, sustainable economic growth, job creation and income generation, especially for young adults.

Paragraph 30 (Rev 1):

This paragraph could make reference to Climate change as the driver for the actions, since it lists actions but not their purpose.

The commitment to increase the contribution of RE and low carbon energy sources is a significant commitment and should remain, basically as written. Questions that may arise regarding this commitment include: does renewable energy include large hydro? Are we really talking about 50% of all energy (including electrical, mechanical and transport)? Or just electricity?

Paragraph 31 (Rev 1):

The word “ratings” used here should be replaced by “standards” and is usually complimented by “and labels”.

Paragraph 32 (Rev 1):

The goal of making all relevant planning and regulatory requirements simpler, etc. is a laudable one but not realistic.

Paragraph 33 (Rev 1):

We suggest a rewording of the second sentence in this paragraph as follows: “*We will develop strategies for sustainable biomass cultivation and production, with particular regard to the need to ensure food security and, by the end of 2012 at the latest, develop a strategy for second-generation and more advanced biofuels that will ensure that they do not compete directly with other agricultural crops for land, water or fertilizer*”.

Paragraph 36 (Rev 1):

How does one verify “universal access to information” on such issues? Given that the region still has 40-50 million people who are un-electrified and many more without access to computers/internet, universal access by 2012 is not realistic.

Paragraph 37 (Rev 1):

The link between economic competitiveness and sustainability should be addressed in the Human Prosperity/Environmental Sustainability if concrete actions are to be included.

Proposed modifications to Draft Summit Declaration as submitted by the OAS Department of Education and Culture(DEC), Technical Secretariat of the Inter-American Committee on Education

EXISTING TEXT IN LATEST VERSION (REV 1) OF V SUMMIT DRAFT DECLARATION

24. We affirm that equitable and timely access to quality education, adapted to local and global realities, is a human right, a public good and a political priority. We therefore commit to continue promoting access to quality basic education for all. Improving early childhood care and education, primary education and continuous teacher training are essential approaches to achieving universal primary education by 2010. We also instruct the Ministers responsible for Education to increase efforts to measure student learning outcomes in the Americas by the year 2010.
25. We reaffirm our commitment to achieving a secondary education enrollment rate of at least 75% by the year 2010 and we now call on the Ministers of Education, with the support of the OAS and specialised regional institutions, to develop gender-sensitive strategies to make secondary education accessible to all our young people, by 2015, especially the most vulnerable and those with special education needs. These strategies must include reform of curricula based on the principles of equity, quality, relevance and efficiency in education, take into account cultural, linguistic and ethnic diversity, and encourage innovation and creativity.

26. Recognising that education is a lifelong process that promotes social inclusion and allows people to contribute fully to the development of society, we agree to give high priority to improving and expanding literacy as well as access to tertiary, vocational and adult education. We, therefore, commit to increasing the tertiary education participation rate to a minimum of 40 per cent by 2020, and urge countries which have already made considerable advances in this area to exchange best practices that will support the efforts of other countries to achieve this target. We also commit to support the ongoing professional development of teachers.

COMMENTS BY THE DEC ON EXISTING TEXT

1. The current text artificially divides phases of the education to which all citizens have a human right into separate levels, treated in separate paragraphs, leading to artificial divisions and competition when in fact a systemic approach to education is necessary to meet the current needs of the region.

2. The current text refers to “continuous teacher training” and describes it as essential to achieve universal *primary* education. In fact, numerous recent studies demonstrate that while the quality of teachers, and teaching, is one of a handful of factors that can improve educational outcomes, in only two out of 18 countries of the region could at least 90% of the teaching force be considered to meet minimum qualifications, as of 2005. This suggests that considerable efforts are required both in *initial teacher education* and in *ongoing professional development* to achieve all of the region’s education goals.

3. The Regional Education Indicators Project (PRIE) demonstrates that “while access to primary education in the region is virtually universal, completion is not...the result of high repetition and drop out rates.” With respect to secondary enrolment, as of the latest (PRIE) statistics, only 10 of the 34 countries had achieved the goal. In six countries, net enrolment rates are below 60%. In only *two* countries (one more was extremely close) had the goal of 75% of young people completing secondary education been achieved.

4. Given these realities, it invites cynicism to have the Leaders recommit to achieving these goals by 2010 (in other words, in one year). In addition, the existing language seems to put all the burden on the Ministers without at the same time assuring some level of investment, as has been done elsewhere in the Summit draft document, for example with respect to Health and with respect to Research and Innovation. The Fourth World Education Forum, meeting in Rio de Janeiro Brazil in March 2006 called on all nations to spend at least six percent of their GDP on education and numerous nations have chosen to work toward this target.

5. Paragraph 26 refers to “vocational” education, an outdated term. The correct reference should be to “technical” or “vocational-technical” education.

6. The Ministers of Education have adopted two action documents since the last Summit, and these should be recognized here: The “Hemispheric Commitment to Early Childhood Education” adopted at the V Ministerial meeting in Cartagena in November, 2007, and the Work Plan of the Inter-American Committee on Education (CIE), which seeks to implement the priorities set by the Ministers at their III, IV and V meetings, and which was reviewed and adopted by the CIE at its IV Regular Meeting in Quito, Ecuador, in October 2008.

PROPOSED SUBSTITUTE TEXT: (4 PARAGRAPHS, 345 WORDS)

24. We affirm that equitable and timely access to quality education at all levels, adapted to local and global realities, is a human right, a public good and a political priority. Recognizing that investing in quality care and education from birth through the early years of primary education has been shown conclusively to improve learning, social, health, and employment outcomes, we reaffirm the Hemispheric Commitment to Early Childhood Education adopted by the Ministers of Education in 2007.
25. We will redouble our efforts to fulfill our commitments to achieving universal completion of primary education and a secondary education enrollment rate of at least 75%, with increasing percentages of young people completing this level. We recognize that while important progress has been made toward the targets we set ourselves at the Second Summit, these goals will not be met by 2010 and significant efforts as well as innovative approaches are still required. We will work to increase overall investment in education to 6% of GDP in order to improve educational outcomes, and we will place high priority on teacher development from initial preparation through all phases of the teaching career. We instruct the Ministers responsible for Education to increase efforts to measure student learning outcomes in the Americas by the year 2010. We call upon them, with the support of the Inter-American Committee on Education (CIE), the OAS General Secretariat, and other partners, to implement the CIE Work Plan 2008-2010 to advance our objectives.
26. To make secondary education accessible and relevant to all our young people, especially the most vulnerable and those with special education needs, we call upon Ministers of Education, with the support of the OAS and specialized international, regional, and civil society institutions, to develop educational strategies and curricula that are gender-sensitive, take into account cultural, linguistic and ethnic diversity, and encourage innovation and creativity.
27. Recognizing that education is a lifelong process that promotes social inclusion and democratic citizenship and allows people to contribute fully to the development of society, we will give high priority to improving and expanding literacy as well as access to tertiary, technical-vocational and adult education. We intend to increase the tertiary education participation rate to a minimum of 40 per cent by 2020.

Proposed modifications to Draft Summit Declaration as submitted by the OAS Department of Education and Culture, Technical Secretariat of the Inter-American Culture Ministerial Process

Existing Text, Paragraph 29:

Culture has a central role in the overall development of our countries, in the fight against poverty, and in our efforts to improve the quality of life of all our peoples. We acknowledge the positive contribution of culture in building social cohesion and in creating stronger, more inclusive communities, and will continue to promote inter-cultural dialogue and respect for cultural diversity, to encourage mutual understanding and convergence, which help reduce conflict, discrimination and the barriers to economic opportunity and social participation. We also commit to increase our efforts to support cultural and creative industries as part of our national policies for the promotion of sustainable economic growth, job creation and income generation, especially for young adults

Comments on Existing Paragraph 29:

The existing paragraph is excellent but has one major gap; it makes no reference to the importance of protecting and promoting cultural heritage, which has been a priority for Ministers of Culture in every Inter-American Ministerial Meeting. This priority is reflected in ongoing work in the context of the Inter-American Committee on Culture (CIC) to share knowledge and practice across member states, including effective practices in educating communities on how to protect heritage sites and manage them in a sustainable manner; this work should be highlighted and strengthened.

Suggested Paragraph 29 with addition of one sentence:

Culture has a central role in the overall development of our countries, in the fight against poverty, and in our efforts to improve the quality of life of all our peoples. We acknowledge the positive contribution of culture in building social cohesion and in creating stronger, more inclusive communities, and will continue to promote inter-cultural dialogue and respect for cultural diversity, to encourage mutual understanding and convergence, which help reduce conflict, discrimination and the barriers to economic opportunity and social participation. We also commit to increase our efforts to support cultural and creative industries as part of our national policies for the promotion of sustainable economic growth, job creation and income generation, especially for young adults. We further commit to facilitating the sharing of knowledge and practices on protecting and promoting cultural heritage and to educating communities on how best to protect their heritage sites and manage them in a sustainable manner.

Existing text, paragraph 50:

We direct the OAS, through the Secretariat for Multi-Dimensional Security, to continue in the preparation of a high level meeting of experts and authorities to develop a common approach to matters related to crime and violence and also to prepare a regional strategy to promote Inter-American cooperation in dealing with criminal gangs, giving special attention to young people.

Comments on Existing Paragraph 50:

The existing paragraph concludes with an appropriate reference to the importance of giving special attention to young people, however, it fails to stress the importance of prevention. As part of effective prevention strategies, involvement in activities in culture and the arts has been proven to have beneficial effects in combating violence and promoting social inclusion and positive values in young people.

Suggested Paragraph 50 with addition of one sentence

We direct the OAS, through the Secretariat for Multi-Dimensional Security, to continue in the preparation of a high level meeting of experts and authorities to develop a common approach to matters related to crime and violence and also to prepare a regional strategy to promote Inter-American cooperation in dealing with criminal gangs, giving special attention to young people. In so doing, we will take into account the proven beneficial effects which involvement in activities in culture and the arts can have in combating violence among young people, in promoting social inclusion, and in the inculcation of positive values.

Existing Text, Paragraph 62:

We reiterate the call, made at the Third Summit of the Americas in Quebec City, for Ministers of Finance to increase their involvement in the Summit of the Americas process and instruct them to explore ways to strengthen the strategic alliances, at the national level, among all

Ministries, including those responsible for education, health, labour, social development, youth, information and communication, agriculture, energy, the environment, and crime and security

Comments on Existing Text, Paragraph 62:

When listing the Ministries that should be part of a strategic alliance to promote human prosperity, Ministries of Culture must also be included, given the fact that culture affects virtually every other area of national development and the culture of a people shapes their attitude to everything they do.

Suggested Paragraph 62 with addition of one word:

We reiterate the call, made at the Third Summit of the Americas in Quebec City, for Ministers of Finance to increase their involvement in the Summit of the Americas process and instruct them to explore ways to strengthen the strategic alliances, at the national level, among all Ministries, including those responsible for education, culture, health, labour, social development, youth, information and communication, agriculture, energy, the environment, and crime and security.

Paragraph 46

Regarding the document Draft Declaration of Commitment for the Fifth Summit of the Americas, the Secretariat suggests including the following input: To add in article 46, line 10, the words: **and port**, so the paragraph will be:

46. We renew our support for the Inter-American Programme for Sustainable Development (IAPSD) and instruct the Ministers and all other authorities responsible for sustainable development to gather in 2010, under the auspices of the OAS, in collaboration with the PAHO and the international financial and development institutions concerned with sustainable development, and with the participation of the academic community and civil society, to assess the achievements of the Programme to date, and to propose, where appropriate, new goals for a renewed IAPSD, with a particular focus on the integrated management of both domestic and shared water resources, prevention and mitigation of disasters, forest and fisheries management, sustainable agricultural management and rural development, ecosystem and biodiversity protection, natural resources management, urban **and port** environmental management and the treatment of hazardous wastes. We will give special attention to the most vulnerable areas, including low-lying coastal regions and small island developing states.

II. COMMENTS OF THE INTER-AMERICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK (IDB)

Preliminary comments on Draft Declaration

The IDB's overall comment is that the draft Declaration is a very complete document, is focused on a few key topics for the region, and will serve as an excellent basis for the

negotiations with the 34 countries of Latin America and the Caribbean. As you well know, the IDB responds to the demands and the mandates of its member countries; based on its charter obligations, the IDB's commitment in support of these activities will follow the direction and the approval of its Board of Executive Directors.

With respect to the principal commitments in the Draft Declaration with specific reference to the IDB's involvement, the IDB has the following suggestions and comments:

Promoting Human Prosperity

- **Para. 6 (Original):** *We commit to exchange information on policies, experiences and good practices in order to support our national efforts to reduce social disparities and inequality, and halve poverty by the year 2015. We request the **Inter-American Development Bank (IDB)** to coordinate the process of reviewing and consolidating all existing social protection and poverty eradication programmes by the end of 2010, in collaboration with the Ministers responsible for Finance, Planning and Development, as well as other regional and sub-regional financial and development institutions, in order to increase efficiency, reduce duplication, identify gaps and optimise the use of resources.*

Comment: The text mentions most of the major issues in human development. Para.6 refers to **social protection programs** and the need to transform existing overlapping and disconnected programs into a net that consistently addresses all the dimensions of poverty, all the problems faced by vulnerable populations in a coordinated way. In other words, the revision and consolidation of social programs is needed not only for the sake of efficiency and optimization of resources but also as an instrument to promote a comprehensive approach to poverty (education for children, training and labor intermediation for adults, healthcare for all, taking into account interdependencies –for example, good jobs are correlated with healthcare and social security benefits).

In paragraph 7, open trade policies are good for growth, but they require a complementary agenda that goes beyond macro-economic policies and private sector development. This agenda should include, for example, re-training of displaced workers, and improving workers' skills. More generally, the Bank considers that **raising productivity** is essential for growth, and increasing productivity requires, among other things, better human capital. It may be possible to switch paragraph 7 before paragraph 6 as the former sets the framework for the rest and the other paragraphs say what we are going to do to achieve that. Also, it is suggested that the issue of training and raising workers skills be addressed explicitly.

When referring to economic integration, regional and global integration may be highlighted.

- **Para. 11 (Original):** *Micro, small and medium-sized enterprises are fundamental to economic growth, employment creation and poverty reduction. We call on the World Bank, **IDB** and other regional banks to accelerate their efforts to promote private sector expansion and development by **promoting doubling of lending to micro, small and medium-sized enterprises and tripling the numbers of enterprises accessing credit by 2012.***

Comment: In this paragraph, the IDB's Multilateral Investment Fund (MIF) supports the goal through leverage of private sector funding for micro-, small and medium-sized enterprises. It is consistent with its targets of leveraging funding along with other private sector participants, enhancing the capacity of banks and other financial institutions to provide this financing (by providing technical assistance and working with regulators), and working on the institutional framework (credit bureaus, rating agencies, supervisory

framework). Support for this goal by the Inter-American Investment Corporation (IIC) may depend on exposure limits and resource allocations under their current integrated business plan.

- **Para. 12 (Original):** *We will work towards eliminating administrative and bureaucratic barriers to the creation of new enterprises. We will, therefore, adopt the necessary reforms to simplify the processes involved in starting and closing business ventures, and commit to reducing business start-up time to a maximum of 30 days by 2012. We call on the **IDB** and the World Bank to support national efforts to improve the legislative frameworks and administrative procedures for achieving this target.*

Comment: According to the 2008 Doing Business report, 11 LAC countries are already below 31 days (Antigua&Barbuda, Argentina, Chile, Dominica, El Salvador, Grenada, Honduras, Jamaica, Mexico, Panama, St. Vincent). This goal could be more challenging, with a target of less than 15 days by 2012.

Promoting Energy Security

- **Para. 38:** *We, therefore, instruct all Ministers with responsibility for Energy, Planning, Regulation and Finance, within the framework of the OAS and the Sustainable Energy Partnership of the Americas (SEPA), with the support and guidance of the **IDB** and the World Bank, taking into account the diverse conditions, opportunities, legislative and regulatory frameworks in our countries, and building on existing energy cooperation and integration initiatives, to **focus their efforts to develop public-private partnerships in projects** that will increase energy efficiency, diversify energy sources, minimise environmental impact, strengthen energy independence, and secure access to safe, affordable energy supplies for all, especially the poorest. **Special attention shall be given in each country to diversify its energy matrix and promote sustainable, financially viable and renewable energy sources.** We further instruct our Ministers to **provide a country by country report by report on such efforts made** by the end of 2011 at the latest.*

Comments: Please see mark-up of this paragraph

Promoting Environmental Sustainability

- **Para. 46:** *We renew our support for the Inter-American Programme for Sustainable Development (IAPSD) and instruct the Ministers and all other authorities responsible for sustainable development to gather in 2010, under the auspices of the OAS, in collaboration with the PAHO and the **international financial and development institutions** concerned with sustainable development, and with the participation of the academic community and civil society, to assess the achievements of the Programme to date, and to propose, where appropriate, new goals for a renewed IAPSD, with a particular focus on the integrated management of both domestic and shared water resources, prevention and mitigation of disasters, forest and fisheries management, sustainable agricultural management and rural development, ecosystem and biodiversity protection, natural resources management, urban environmental management and the treatment of hazardous wastes. We will give special attention to the most vulnerable areas, including low-lying coastal regions and small island developing states.*
- **Para. 47:** *We also direct the Ministers and all other authorities responsible for sustainable development, in conjunction with the World Bank and the **IDB**, working under the auspices of the OAS, to undertake a comprehensive review of the potential impacts of climate change for all the nations of the Americas by 2011, and to formulate national Plans of Action for the management and mitigation of these impacts, with special attention to the needs of people likely to be displaced or to lose their livelihoods.*

*We further instruct that each of these national reviews be used to inform the development of a Regional Strategy for the Management of Climate Change Impacts, to be formulated jointly by the World Bank and the **IDB** by 2013.*

Comment: The IDB agrees with these paragraphs on promoting environmental sustainability, which are consistent with the IDB's goals.

Additional suggestions:

It may be appropriate to include the concept of IDB Group and World Bank Group as some of the promotion of private sector development involves organizations that fall within these concepts.

It may also be important to mention the importance of improving technology and technology readiness for purposes of overall country's and regional competitiveness at the national and sub-national level (paragraph 28). When referring to economic integration (paragraph 7), regional and global integration may be highlighted.

III. COMMENTS OF THE ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN (ECLAC)

Paragraph 5 (Original):

Deep and persistent inequalities continue to exist, especially in **the family**, education, income levels, health and nutritional status, exposure to violence and crime, and access to basic services. In response, we will continue to develop and implement social protection programmes

that are specifically targeted to the poor and vulnerable groups in our societies, in order to ensure equal access for all men and women to basic social services such as water, housing, healthcare, food and sanitation.

Paragraph 6 (Original):

We commit to exchange information on policies, experiences and good practices in order to support our national efforts to reduce social **and gender** disparities and inequality, and halve poverty by the year 2015. We request the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) to coordinate the process of reviewing and consolidating all existing social protection and poverty eradication programmes by the end of 2010, in collaboration with the Ministers responsible for Finance, Planning and Development, as well as other regional and sub-regional financial and development institutions, in order to increase efficiency, reduce duplication, identify gaps and optimise the use of resources.

Paragraph 9 (Original):

With the support of the ILO and in accordance with the Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work, we will adopt the necessary policies and regulations to facilitate and promote the movement of enterprises and workers from the informal to the formal sector. **We also reiterate the need to support all the international initiatives on the protection of all migrants, regardless of their migratory situation.** We also reaffirm that all migrants regardless of their immigration status, should be accorded the full protection of human rights and the full observance of labour laws applicable to them.

SUGGESTED NEW PARAGRAPH (ORIGINAL)¹

We will work towards the elimination of obstacles to the integration of women into the labor market, promoting policies of child care and co-responsibility between men and women in caring for children, the elderly and the infirm; as well, to enhance funding for the promotion of gender equality and the empowerment of women, integrating gender perspectives in all public policies pursuant to existing international commitments.

Paragraph 16 (Original):

We recognize that the problems of inequality of access and exclusion from basic health services persist, especially among the most **vulnerable discriminated**, including women, children, indigenous peoples, **older persons** and the poor. We, therefore, commit to providing essential social protection and universal access to quality healthcare, taking into account labour, environment, gender and social security policies, and will increase public spending on health to at least 5% of GDP by 2015 in order to address the health challenges faced by our people.

Paragraph 26 (Original):

Recognising that education is a lifelong process that promotes social inclusion and allows people to contribute more fully to their societies, we give high priority to improving the quality of, and access to, tertiary, vocational and adult education, especially for women, rural inhabitants, persons with disabilities, Afro-descendants, indigenous peoples, **and older**

¹ Include new paragraph after Paragraph 11 (Original)

persons. We, therefore, commit to increasing the tertiary participation rate to a minimum of 40 per cent by 2020, and urge countries which have already made considerable advances in this area, to exchange good practices that will support the efforts of other countries to achieve this target. We also commit to support the ongoing professional development of teachers.

Comments on the New Paragraph (Original):

Recent ECLAC studies indicate that this topic has acquired great importance for the region's countries, on account of the unprecedented ageing of their populations. In 1950, there were a little over 9 million old people, accounting for 5.6% of the population.

Fifty years later (2005), their number had increased to 50 million and they accounted for 9% of the total population; and, by 2050, it is estimated that people aged 60 and over will number around 187 million, for more than 24% of the region's population.

The effects of these changes will be felt more strongly over the coming decades, as the social and demographic maturation of the phenomenon demands progressive modifications in the areas of social security, health, and other similar services currently provided for the population. Thus, the challenges facing the region's societies and economies are enormous, and the way to overcome them depends on the decisions taken regarding the potential of social protection and the mechanisms it uses.

Paragraph 30 (Original):

We will develop clean, affordable and sustainable energy systems by reducing the **energy-** and carbon-intensity of our economies, promoting energy efficiency in all sectors, diversifying our energy by developing **sources with low ~~low~~-carbon content** and renewable sources **of energy**, and encouraging the cleaner, more efficient use of fossil fuels. We commit to increase the contribution of renewable and low-carbon-**content** energy sources to meet a minimum of 50 per cent of our national primary energy demands by 2050 at the latest and will introduce, as necessary, new financing and policy frameworks in order to facilitate and accelerate this process.

Paragraph 33 (Original):

Recognising the potential of new and emerging technologies for diversifying the energy matrix, we will encourage the development, ~~manufacture~~ **production** and use of both current and **second-generation ~~next-generation~~** biofuels including sugar-based, cellulosic, algal and bacterial biofuels, and will develop a set of compatible specifications by the end of 2015 in order to facilitate their trade and increased use, taking into account existing and planned standards. We will develop strategies for sustainable biomass cultivation and production, with particular regard to the need to ensure food security and, by the end of 2012 at the latest, develop a strategy for second-generation and more advanced biofuels that will ensure that they do not compete directly with other agricultural crops for land, water or fertilizer. We will also support the development and use of on and off-shore wind turbines, conventional and polymer photovoltaics, solar towers, geothermal and hydropower, hydrogen fuel cells and other new energy technologies.

Paragraph 34 (Original):

Many renewable sources of energy are intermittent or only available in particular locations. We will, therefore, develop and invest in new energy infrastructures, support the development of cross-border, efficient low-carbon energy generation and distribution **networks ~~grids~~** and other energy-trading and cooperation networks. We will cooperate to improve the security, safety and stability of our critical energy infrastructure and supply networks and to ensure that all links in

the energy supply chain operate to the highest standards of human health and safety, environmental protection and physical security.

Paragraph 35 (Original):

We commit to the promotion of clean energy through research and development, the transfer of environmentally ~~sound~~ **sustainable** technologies, and the commercialization of new, cleaner energy **alternatives** ~~solutions~~. Priority will be given to increasing international cooperation and sharing information in the search for solutions that can benefit all our nations.

Paragraph 36 (Original):

We will increase public awareness on energy and environmental issues and commit to ensuring, by 2012, that the people of the Americas have universal access to accurate, reliable and impartial information on energy, environmental and climate change issues.

Paragraph 37 (Original):

Recognising that the issues of the availability, cost and security of our energy supplies, our economic competitiveness and the sustainability of our environment are closely intertwined, we commit to the development of a coherent policy framework that takes into consideration our diverse situations, circumstances and opportunities and allows for the simultaneous strengthening and diversification of all our economies.

Paragraph 38 (Original):

We, therefore, instruct all Ministers with responsibility for Energy, Planning, Regulation and Finance, within the framework of the OAS and the Sustainable Energy Partnership of the Americas (SEPA), with the support and guidance of the IDB, ~~and~~ the World Bank **and ECLAC**, taking into account the diverse conditions, opportunities, legislative and regulatory frameworks in our countries, and building on existing energy cooperation and integration initiatives, to develop a strategy of cooperation among our nations, international organisations and the private sector that will increase energy efficiency, diversify energy sources, minimise environmental impact, strengthen energy independence, and secure access to safe, affordable energy supplies for all, especially the poorest. We further instruct our Ministers to develop this strategy by the end of 2011 at the latest.

IV. COMMENTS OF THE PAN AMERICAN HEALTH ORGANIZATION (PAHO)

- The Region's most important health policy framework, which guides hemispheric cooperation—the Health Agenda for the Americas 2008–2017—is mentioned only in passing in paragraph 16. It should be discussed in a separate paragraph, thus giving it the attention that it warrants. Drawn up by the countries of the Region and launched during the 37th General Assembly of the Organization of American States, the Agenda enjoys the approval and support of all the Ministers of Health of the Americas.

- Paragraph 16 talks about public investment in health. Although health is recognized as part of **investment in human capital**, the financial expression of the resources allocated to health is recorded as expenditure and not as investment. Operating and capital expenditure are considered public health expenditure, so the correct term would thus be public health expenditure as a proportion of gross domestic product (GDP). The problems of exclusion and lack of access to quality health services affect not only the most vulnerable groups, but, in general, people from lower-income social groups in urban and rural areas alike. All the available information and analysis on trends in public health expenditure in the Latin American and Caribbean countries indicate that to implement policies for universal access to quality health services (which includes access to drugs), public health expenditure should not be less than 6% of GDP. This is necessary but it is not enough, since in addition to increasing expenditure, the distributive impact on the neediest social groups must be improved.
- The two paragraphs (18 and 19) devoted to chronic noncommunicable diseases can be adequately summarized in a single paragraph.
- In addition to suffering from translation problems (Spanish version), paragraph 20 reduces the concept of primary health care (PHC) to action for the prevention and early detection of diseases. The paragraph is confusing and mixes health programs (sexual and reproductive health; mental health) with the topic of access to drugs. It should be pointed out that October 2008 marked the 30th anniversary of the Alma-Ata Declaration on Primary Health Care. A series of high-level global and regional meetings have been held with a view to renewing this strategy. In 2005, the 46th Directing Council of PAHO approved new approaches to primary care based on the Declaration of Montevideo. In this regard, it is suggested that any mention of PHC include the guidelines and principles agreed upon by the Hemisphere's highest-level health authorities.
- Paragraph 21 talks about “malnutrition in our populations” and improving nutrition levels by 2015, pursuant to the guidelines of the Regional Strategy on Nutrition in Health and Development, approved by the Governing Bodies of PAHO before the extent of the food crisis had become apparent. A problem considered far more important and requiring the urgent attention of Heads of State and Government is chronic malnutrition in children. These targets are included in the Millennium Development Goals (MDG) and progress toward meeting them is now threatened by the crisis in food prices. Furthermore, in this same vein, PAHO includes several components of the Regional Strategy mentioned in paragraph 21 in a broader effort that involves interagency coordination. In the current situation, PAHO is giving priority to the Pan American Alliance for Nutrition and Development.
- Paragraph 22 talks about implementing the International Health Regulations (IHR) (the correct translation is *Reglamento Sanitario Internacional* – RSI) to combat the transmission of diseases and mentions dengue, yellow fever, malaria, avian flu, and pandemic influenza. This assertion is incorrect, since the IHR are not a mechanism for “combating” the transmission of diseases. The IHR are a legally binding agreement designed to contribute to international security in the sphere of public health. They are a new international framework for coordinating the management of events that can constitute a “public health emergency of international concern.” Dengue and malaria are not considered diseases that pose a threat to international public health. The national contingency plans were drawn up to provide timely alerts and responses to the threat of pandemic influenza, and not in response to the IHR. Both the contingency plans for avian flu and pandemic influenza and aspects of the International Health Regulations were the subject mandates from the Mar del Plata Summit. The Regulations contain a series of

procedures for managing events and establishes a series of obligations known as “core capacity requirements for surveillance and response” that countries must fulfill by 2012. Therefore, we do not consider it necessary to have a paragraph on this topic in the Port-of-Spain Declaration of Commitments.

- Some of the content of Paragraph 23 is incorrect –it states, for example, that PAHO coordinates the Regional HIV/STI Plan for the Health Sector 2006–2015, and that its implementation should be coordinated with UNAIDS and UNFPA. The respective responsibilities of each of the United Nations agencies in the Region have been established and actions at the regional, sub-regional, and national level are coordinated through the Regional Directors and UNAIDS. The Global Fund to Fight HIV/AIDS, Tuberculosis, and Malaria receives contributions from the developed countries, philanthropic foundations, and the private sector. It is therefore incorrect to refer to a commitment to strengthen and provide adequate financing for the Fund, as this is not a function of the governments.

PROPOSED DRAFT OF THE HEALTH-RELATED PARAGRAPHS IN THE DECLARATION OF COMMITMENTS, SECTION ON HUMAN PROSPERITY (PARAGRAPHS 16 TO 23)

Pursuant to the aforementioned considerations and bearing in mind the comments of the national delegations and coordinators, PAHO makes the following proposal:

It is recommended that the Health Section begin with the paragraph on the Health Agenda for the Americas:

16. We endorse the Health Agenda for the Americas 2008–2017, launched by the Ministers of Health at the 37th General Assembly of the Organization of American States in Panama City on 3 June 2007, whose principles, values, and lines of action are the policy framework that guides the cooperative and collective work to promote the health and development of the peoples of the Americas. We ask the Pan American Health Organization to support implementation of the agenda, promote cooperation among countries, and facilitate evaluation of the progress made.

Proposed draft of paragraph 16 of the Declaration, which now becomes paragraph 17:

17. We recognize that the problems of exclusion and inequality in access to health services persist, chiefly among low-income groups in urban and rural areas alike. We commit to promoting policies to promote universal access to quality health care, including access to essential drugs and prevention programs for the early detection of diseases, for which we shall consider progressive increases in public health expenditure to a level of at least 5% of GDP by 2015. Progress shall be made in the adoption of measures to heighten the impact and benefits of public health expenditure for the neediest population groups in vulnerable social and economic situations, ensuring the gender approach and linkage with labor and social protection policies.

Proposed draft of paragraph 17 of the Declaration, which now becomes paragraph 18:

18. We recognize the progress made in meeting the targets set in the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) with respect to the health of mothers and children under 5. However, we express our concern about the high maternal mortality rates still found in several countries and about the lack of a significant decline in deaths among newborns. In this context, we endorse the regional South-South cooperation initiative within the framework of the Deliver NOW for Women and Children Global Initiative, as well as the regional interagency mechanism of the Strategic Consensus for the reduction of maternal

mortality. We call on the Pan American Health Organization (PAHO) to cooperate with the countries in implementing the Regional Strategy and Plan of Action for Neonatal Health within the Continuum of Maternal, Newborn, and Child Care.

Proposed draft of paragraph 19, which summarizes the content of 18 and 19:

19. We express our concern about the rapid increase in the prevalence of non-communicable diseases (NCDs). In order to halt this silent epidemic, which represents the greatest burden of disease and disability in the Region, we commit to fostering integrated strategies at the national, local, and community levels, promoting collaboration by the private sector, the media, and civil society organizations. We also commit to introducing measures to reduce smoking, following the guidelines contained in the WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control. We reiterate our support for PAHO's Regional Strategy and Plan of Action for an Integrated Approach to Prevention and Control of Chronic Diseases, including Diet, Physical Activity and Health and we request the Ministers of Health to set up NCD and risk-factor surveillance systems as an integral part of national public health surveillance systems. We shall facilitate the creation of national commissions on non-communicable diseases, and we call on PAHO to assist the countries in meeting the aforementioned commitments.

Proposed draft of paragraph 20:

20. We commit to promoting primary health care (PHC) as the linchpin of health systems and services development to make the vision of "health for all" a reality, providing support for the 10 commitments made by our health authorities at the highest level in the 2005 Declaration of Montevideo on the New Orientations for Primary Health Care. We call on PAHO to promote cooperation among countries, collaborate and facilitate the sharing of experiences, and analyze and evaluate the progress made.

Proposed draft of paragraph 21:

21. We express our concern about the threat posed by rising food prices to the sustainability of achievements in combating poverty, hunger, and, mainly, the elimination of chronic child malnutrition in the Region. We consider it a high priority to address this problem through the coordinated action of government institutions, encouraging private sector and civil society participation. We call upon international organizations to coordinate their efforts to support the countries and to facilitate the implementation of action plans under the guidelines developed by the United Nations agencies in the Pan American Alliance for Nutrition and Development.

Proposed draft of paragraph 23, which now becomes 22:

22. We must redouble the efforts of government institutions and civil society organizations to halt the spread of the HIV/AIDS epidemic. We commit to continuing to promote prevention programs, with special emphasis on the groups at higher risk, and to guaranteeing universal access to care and antiretroviral therapy for 100% of people living with HIV by 2015. We likewise commit to reducing the incidence of vertical mother-to-child transmission of HIV to less than 5% by that same year. We call upon the competent international agencies to collaborate with the countries in meeting the proposed objectives, and we especially request that PAHO, WHO, and UNAIDS study and evaluate the progress made by the countries of the Region. We furthermore recognize efforts to coordinate intersectoral policies and actions to halt the HIV/AIDS epidemic, and we endorse the recommendations and commitments made at the 1st Meeting of Ministers of Health and Education to Stop HIV and STIs in Latin America and the Caribbean, held in Mexico City on 1 August 2008, whose theme was "Preventing through Education."

16. We recognize that the problems of inequality of access to comprehensive healthcare persists, especially among vulnerable groups. We, therefore, commit to redoubling our efforts to **extend social health protection**^[U1] ~~promote essential social protection~~ and identify and implement strategies to improve **progress toward universal** access to quality comprehensive healthcare, taking into account labour, environment, gender-sensitive and social security policies, as well as the Health Agenda for the Americas 2008-2017, and will seek to provide necessary resources in order to improve our health indicators.
20. We commit to improving the health of all our people **through** ~~by promoting~~^[U2] the renewal of primary healthcare and the sustainable access by all sectors of the public to ~~basic~~ **essential** healthcare services, including reproductive healthcare and mental health services, as well as to essential medicines. We therefore commit to take the necessary actions, in accordance with the needs and capabilities of each of our countries, to achieve the commitments made in the 2005 Declaration of Montevideo on The New Orientations for Primary Healthcare.
21. We commit to improving the nutritional levels of all the people of the Americas by 2015 and to the full implementation of the Regional Strategy on Nutrition and Health Development 2006-2015, **approved by the PAHO Member States**, ~~coordinated by PAHO~~^[U3] **and we** will continue to promote the integration of nutrition into social and economic policies and plans ~~and to reduce nutritional deficiencies through prevention and treatment strategies, including those targeted at the control of obesity and other nutrition-related diseases. We also commit to increase awareness and educate our populations about the importance of diet and physical activity.~~^[U4] **We also recognize that the progress made in eradicating chronic child malnutrition could be threatened by the growing increases in food prices, and so we place a high priority on improving cooperation among the public agencies that work on this problem, promoting participation by the private sector, civil society, and community organizations. We call for greater coordination of the actions of international organizations in support of national efforts to eradicate chronic child malnutrition, to which end we give our backing to the Pan American Alliance for Nutrition and Development.**

(PENDING – Modified text proposed by the National Secretariat following the meeting of the Fifth SIRG, 2008 – Washington DC)

- 21 *bis* We recognize that the sustainability of our achievements in combating poverty, hunger and chronic malnutrition, especially in children, are being threatened by rising food prices. We consider it a high priority to address the food and nutrition crisis through the joint efforts of the public and private sectors, and civil society.^[U5] We call upon international organizations support national efforts to address this crisis and to facilitate the implementation of the Action Plan developed by the Pan American Alliance for Nutrition and Development.^[U6]
22. We reaffirm our commitment to the implementation of the International Health Regulations (IHR) (2005) to ~~combat the international transmission~~^[U7] **prevent the international spread** of diseases such as pandemic influenza, yellow fever, dengue, ~~and malaria,~~ **and others, and we** ~~We~~ commit to **establish in our countries the basic**

capacities needed for surveillance and for responding to events that could constitute public health emergencies of international concern^[U8] enhancing the capacity for disease surveillance, prevention and management in our countries. We call on PAHO to **work with and support the countries in accordance with its functions entrusted to it in the IHR (2005), particularly through health operations in the event of epidemic emergencies**^[U9] strengthen its capacities to perform fully the functions entrusted to it in the IHR (2005), especially in the area of disease prevention operations against epidemic emergencies.

~~23.~~ We are committed to meeting the Millennium Declaration goal of halting and [\[US: beginning to reverse\]](#) the spread of HIV/AIDS by 2015 [\[US: through, inter alia, identification and implementation of strategies to scale up towards the goal of by providing\]](#) [\[Venezuela: as well as to promote scientific and social research geared towards producing inputs and high quality medicines and ensure access to treatment\]](#) universal access [\[US: for men, women and children\]](#) to comprehensive prevention, care, treatment and support [\[US: services\]](#). We will implement the Regional HIV/STI Plan for the Health Sector 2006-2015, [\[US: under the in\]](#) coordination [\[US: with of\]](#) PAHO [\[US:, and in collaboration with\]](#) UNAIDS and UNFPA. We commit to strengthening public policies aimed at reducing the incidence of mother-to-child transmission of HIV to less than 5% by 2015. [\[US: We also support the recommendations and commitments made at the First Meeting of Ministers of Health and Education of Latin America and the Caribbean to coordinate policy and intersectoral action to prevent the spread of HIV/AIDS.\]](#) We reiterate our commitment to strengthening [\[US: and providing adequate financing to\]](#) the Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria. [\[El Salvador: We call on the developed countries and all entities collaborating with the Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria to increase their financial support to help countries halt and reverse the spread of HIV/AIDS, as we committed to do in the Millennium Declaration.\]](#)

V. COMMENTS OF THE WORLD BANK

Paragraph 11 (Rev 1):

We support the IDB’s proposal to include “promoting” in the language of the paragraph. It is our role as multilateral institutions to promote lending to micro, small, and medium-sized enterprises, and to promote their access to credit through our dialogue with governments regarding legal and regulatory framework in addition to any direct lending that we may do. Government policies are what ultimately make the difference.

The International Finance Corporation (IFC), the part of the World Bank Group that lends to the private sector, is actively engaged in creating micro, small, and medium-sized enterprises lending facilities.

We would also like to comment that while we believe it is generally good to identify specific targets, in this case, it is important to emphasize that in order for growth of businesses to be sustainable, the targets (i.e. doubling of lending and tripling of access to credit for enterprises), should be adjusted to the economic realities of each country and the current global financial situation. Thus, we would suggest that these targets be reassessed.

Paragraph 12 (Rev 1):

This is certainly an area where the World Bank is very engaged. We are currently expanding Technical Assistance that is provided to help countries improve their business environment. The IFC publishes their “Doing Business” Report every year which uses various indicators that measure the ease of doing business in countries around the world. The report helps bring attention to specific issues so that governments enact policies that improve their country’s business environment.

**VI. COMMENTS OF THE INTER-AMERICAN INSTITUTE FOR COOPERATION
ON AGRICULTURE (IICA)**

As requested in Antigua by the US delegation regarding paragraph 15, the term regional initiatives for repositioning agriculture and rural life is mainly reference to several multilateral initiatives among member states, particularly in Central America and the Caribbean, to look at agriculture within the priorities of their National Agendas in the context defined in the Agro Plan.

Three most clear examples of these initiatives are:

- 1) The Alliance for Sustainable Development of Agriculture and the Rural Milieu (“The Alliance”) - Caribbean Week of Agriculture (CWA)
- 2) The Central American Agricultural Council – CAC – Central American Agricultural Policy - 2008 – 2017 (Consejo Agropecuario Centroamericano (CAC). Política Agrícola Centroamericana 2008 – 2017)
- 3) CARICOM. Jagdeo Initiative.

Regarding “repositioning”, which is still in brackets in the outcome document received, that term (as clarified during the SIRG) was the one used by the Member States in the text (page 38, par 7 of the English printed version) of the Agro 2003- 2015 Plan, Hemispheric Ministerial Agreement Guatemala 2007 for Agriculture and Rural Life in the Americas, celebrated in the context of the Summit of the Americas process, and signed by the Ministers of Agriculture of the 34 countries including the United States (July 2007).

To be precise, paragraph 7 of such Agreement states that:

Repositioning of rural issues in national strategies

To participate proactively in the repositioning of agriculture and rural issues and priorities in national strategies by promoting in society an increased understanding of the contributions made by the rural sector, a rural-urban balance in the national development agenda and efforts to overcome biases and exclusions that are detrimental to rural communities.

“Food Sovereignty”

“Food sovereignty” is a socio-political term rather than a technical term. In IICA we do not use the term Food Sovereignty in our documents or presentations given the lack of a consensually accepted political agreement among Member States regarding this concept and the high degree of controversy that some of its aspects generate.

The term Food Sovereignty was originally coined by members of an NGO named [Via Campesina](#) in 1996 but it did not come into a wider public attention until 2002, when a Forum on Food Sovereignty was celebrated in Rome by several like-minded NGOs. Many other forums and documents with more or less similar or slightly alternative interpretations - and debates about them - can be found on the Internet, but the above mentioned Forum, and the documents emanating from it, remains at the core of the Food Sovereignty term/debate.

For such reasons we are attaching both the English and Spanish versions of the Political Statement of the NGOs at that Forum in which Food Sovereignty is not only defined but specifically interpreted into certain specific actions recommended by the participants. We are also attaching a briefer bilingual statement from the same Forum which does not include the full Plan of Action where some of the more controversial recommendations were spelled out. (Spanish was apparently the original language)

2002 Rome NGO/CSO Forum for Food Sovereignty



June 8 – 13, 2002

NGO/CSO Forum for food sovereignty

**Food Sovereignty: A Right For All
Political Statement of the NGO/CSO Forum for Food
Sovereignty**

The Failure Since 1996 and the New Official Declaration

The social movements, farmer, fisherfolk, pastoralists', indigenous peoples', environmentalist, women's organizations, trade unions, and NGOs gathered here in Rome, express our collective disappointment in, and rejection of, the official Declaration of the World Food Summit: *five years later*. Far from analyzing and correcting the problems that have made it impossible to make progress over the past five years toward eliminating hunger, this new plan of action compounds the error of "more of the same failed medicine" with destructive prescriptions that will make the situation even worse.

The 1996 Plan of Action has not failed because of a lack of political will and resources, but rather it has failed because it supports policies that lead to hunger, policies that support economic liberalization for the South and cultural homogeneity, which are backed by military force if the first wave of prescriptive actions fail. Only fundamentally different policies, which are based on the dignity and livelihoods of communities can end hunger. We affirm our belief that this is possible and urgently needed.

Since 1996 governments and international institutions have presided over globalization and liberalization, intensifying the structural causes of hunger and malnutrition. These have forced markets open to dumping of agricultural products, privatization of basic social and economic support institutions, the privatization and commodification of communal and public land, water, fishing grounds and forests. Parallel to this, we witness the increasingly brutal repression of social movements resisting the New World Order.

This political will has also opened the doors to the unbridled monopolization and concentration of resources and productive processes in the hands of a few giant corporations. The imposition of intensive, externally dependent models of production has destroyed the

environments and livelihoods of our communities. Furthermore, it has created food insecurity and has put the focus on short-term productivity gains using harmful technologies such as GMOs.

The results have been the displacements of peoples and massive migration, the loss of jobs that pay living wages, the destruction of the land and other resources that peoples depend on, an increase in polarization between rich and poor and within and between North and South, a deepening of poverty around the world, and an increase of hunger in the vast majority of nations.

There will be no progress toward the goal of eliminating hunger without a reversal of these policies and trends, but the current declaration offers no hope of such a reversal. It emphasizes trade liberalization, the greatest force undermining livelihoods around the world, has diluted the concept of the human right to food, proposes more enhanced neoliberal structural adjustment in the guise of HIPC programs, recommends more emphasis on biotechnology and genetic engineering, and fails to support strengthening of production by the poor themselves for local markets or the radical redistribution of access to productive resources that is fundamental to real change for the better. On the basis of this plan of action, no amount of political will or resources will lead to a major reduction in hunger or the poverty that underlies it.

Food Sovereignty: The Fundamental Approach

In contrast to the proposed International Alliance Against Hunger, which is worse than “more of the same medicine”, we counterpose the unifying concept of Food Sovereignty as the umbrella under which we outline the actions and strategies that are needed to truly end hunger.

What is Food Sovereignty? Food Sovereignty is **the RIGHT** of peoples, communities, and countries to define their own agricultural, labor, fishing, food and land policies which are ecologically, socially, economically and culturally appropriate to their unique circumstances. It includes the true right to food and to produce food, which means that all people have the right to safe, nutritious and culturally appropriate food and to food-producing resources and the ability to sustain themselves and their societies.

Food Sovereignty requires:

- **Placing priority** on food production for domestic and local markets, based on peasant and family farmer diversified and agroecologically based production systems
- **Ensuring fair** prices for farmers, which means the power to protect internal markets from low-priced, dumped imports
- Access to land, water, forests, fishing areas and other productive resources through genuine redistribution, not by market forces and World Bank sponsored “market-assisted land reforms.”

- **Recognition and promotion of women's role** in food production and equitable access and control over productive resources
- **Community control over productive resources**, as opposed to corporate ownership of land, water, and genetic and other resources
- **Protecting seeds**, the basis of food and life itself, for the free exchange and use of farmers, which means no patents on life and a moratorium on the genetically modified crops which lead to the genetic pollution of essential genetic diversity of plants and animals.
- **Public investment** in support for the productive activities of families, and communities, geared toward empowerment, local control and production of food for people and local markets.

Food Sovereignty means the primacy of people's and community's rights to food and food production, over trade concerns. This entails the support and promotion of local markets and producers over production for export and food imports.

To achieve Food Sovereignty:

- We will strengthen our social movements, and develop the organizations of farmers, women, indigenous peoples, workers, fisherfolk and the urban poor in each of our countries
- We will advance regional and international solidarity and cooperation, and strengthen our common struggles
- We will struggle to realize genuine agrarian and fisheries reform, rangeland and forestry reform, and achieve comprehensive and integral redistribution of productive resources in favor of the poor and the landless
- We will fight for the strong guarantee of the rights of workers to organize, bargain collectively, have safe and dignified working conditions and living wages
- We will struggle for the equal access of women to productive resources and the end to patriarchal structures in agriculture and socio-economic and cultural aspects of food.
- We will fight for the right of Indigenous peoples to their cultures, domain, and productive resources.
- We call for an end to the neoliberal economic policies being imposed by the World Bank, WTO, the IMF and Northern countries and other multilateral and regional free trade agreements, such as the FTAA and NEPAD
- We demand the removal of agriculture from the WTO
- We will fight to stop genetic engineering and the patenting of life and demand an immediate ban of terminator and similar genetic use restriction technologies
- We demand an end to the passing off of GMO food in food aid
- We demand an immediate stop to the war on people and the land around the world and an end to the repression of peoples' movements, as well as an immediate end to the illegal occupation of Palestine, the embargoes of Cuba and Iraq and the use of food as an instrument of blackmail
- We demand support for the development and dissemination of agroecological systems of production

- We call for a Convention on Food Sovereignty in order to enshrine the principles of Food Sovereignty in international law and institute food sovereignty as the principal policy framework for addressing food and agriculture.

Finally, “one size fits all” policies like those emanating from the World Bank, WTO and IMF must be replaced with a vision of “**one world with room for many worlds,**” where strength and human dignity are built through solidarity and respect for diversity, and all countries and peoples have the right to define their own policies.

To that end, we resolve to build social awareness and our movements for the fight to defeat the WTO at Cancun in September of 2003.

Thanks.

**2002 Rome NGO/CSO Forum
for Food Sovereignty**



June 8 – 13, 2002

NGO/CSO Forum for food sovereignty

**Food Sovereignty: A Right For All
Political Statement of the NGO/CSO Forum for Food
Sovereignty**

...

What is Food Sovereignty? Food Sovereignty is **the RIGHT** of peoples, communities, and countries to define their own agricultural, labor, fishing, food and land policies which are ecologically, socially, economically and culturally appropriate to their unique circumstances. It includes the true right to food and to produce food, which means that all people have the right to safe, nutritious and culturally appropriate food and to food-producing resources and the ability to sustain themselves and their societies.

Food Sovereignty requires:

- **Placing priority** on food production for domestic and local markets, based on peasant and family farmer diversified and agroecologically based production systems
- **Ensuring fair** prices for farmers, which means the power to protect internal markets from low-priced, dumped imports
- Access to land, water, forests, fishing areas and other productive resources through genuine redistribution, not by market forces and World Bank sponsored “market-assisted land reforms.”
- **Recognition and promotion of women’s role** in food production and equitable access and control over productive resources
- **Community control over productive resources**, as opposed to corporate ownership of land, water, and genetic and other resources
- **Protecting seeds**, the basis of food and life itself, for the free exchange and use of farmers, which means no patents on life and a moratorium on the genetically modified crops which lead to the genetic pollution of essential genetic diversity of plants and animals.
- **Public investment** in support for the productive activities of families, and communities, geared toward empowerment, local control and production of food for people and local markets.

Food Sovereignty means the primacy of people’s and community’s rights to food and food production, over trade concerns. This entails the support and promotion of local markets and producers over production for export and food imports.

...

...

VII. COMMENTS OF THE INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATION FOR MIGRATION (IOM)

IOM would suggest that migrants can in some cases be reasonably considered to form a vulnerable group, particularly in cases where their migration has not been under optimal conditions, and where their status in a country is not fully regular. This is not to suggest that all migrants should be considered in this fashion, but certainly some of them are quite vulnerable. These references occur in Paragraphs 5, 16, and 25.

IOM would suggest that an explicit linkage be made in paragraph 7 to recognize the potential for contributions by the diaspora to achieving growth.

Paragraph 9:

Migration as such is not mentioned extensively in the document, with only one reference in paragraph 9.

Nonetheless, IOM submits that linkages between human prosperity and migration exist, that could usefully be brought out in the document.

Migration contributes to human prosperity through offering to those who migrate opportunities to better their own condition, principally economically, but also in other ways. Such migration of course needs to be under reasonable conditions for the maximum benefits to be obtained, and needs to be well-managed.

If well-managed, migration brings benefits not only to the migrant and the family in terms of increased income, but also communities and countries of origin through remittances. Countries of destination benefit as well from the additions to the labor force, and linkages between the diaspora and the country of origin can be encouraged to contribute to development.

Migration can also create difficulties, sometimes in separation of families, sometimes in uses of remittances which do not contribute to overall development or loss of human capital, those difficulties can be minimized through appropriate policies, and thus contribute more effectively to the growth in human prosperity.

Paragraph 10:

IOM has noted that there is in the declaration a “commitment to eliminate forced labour before 2010”. One of the contributing factors to forced labor is trafficking in persons, through which people are induced to migrate under false pretenses, having been promised work under very different conditions than that found upon arrival, and who are coerced into remaining in those jobs through various means, including being prevented from contacting the authorities and withholding of travel documents.

In the hemisphere, IOM has a number of programs which relate to the declaration, in particular to trafficking in persons.

Paragraph 13:

IOM would suggest that an explicit linkage be made in paragraph 13 to recognize the potential for contributions by the diaspora to fostering innovation and entrepreneurship.

VIII. COMMENTS OF THE INTERNATIONAL LABOR ORGANIZATION (ILO)

Paragraph 8 (Original):

~~In accordance with the Decent Work in the Americas: An Agenda for the Hemisphere (2006-2015), we will continue to facilitate and encourage the creation of more decent and productive employment opportunities in the formal sector. We believe that the 2006-1015 Agenda for the Hemisphere, which was studied by the ILO's XVI Regional Meeting for the Americas in 2006, and the ILO Declaration on Social Justice for a Fair Globalization of 2008, are~~ **is a** useful tools for creating **decent work** ~~quality employment~~, attaining **human prosperity, and overcoming poverty and strengthening democracy**. We instruct the Ministers of Labour, within the context of the OAS Inter-American Conference of Ministers of Labour, in collaboration with ~~the unions and the employers' organizations~~ **their workers' and employers' consultative bodies workers' and employers' organisations** and with the support of the International Labour Organisation (ILO), to ~~develop a coordinated plan~~ continue **to make progress toward attaining** to address the objectives of the Agenda by the end of 2010, **within a framework of equality**.

We agree with the proposed modification to the paragraph made by the Mexican Delegation, and we add the necessary reference to the ILO Declaration on Social Justice for a Fair Globalization, adopted by the 97th CIT, as the proper approach for making decent work a central element in economic and social policies and an essential factor for promoting human prosperity and reducing of poverty within democracy.

The modifications proposed by the ILO appear in bold and are based on Mexico's proposal for paragraph 8.

Paragraph 9 (Original):

With the support of the ILO and in accordance with the Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work, we will adopt the necessary policies and regulations to facilitate and promote the movement of enterprises and workers from the informal to the formal **economy** ~~sector~~. We also ~~reaffirm that all migrants regardless of their immigration status, should be accorded the full protection of human rights and the full observance of labour laws applicable to them.~~ We reaffirm the importance of observing labour laws and fully protecting the human rights of all migrants regardless of their ~~immigration~~ migratory status.

We agree that the proposal of the Argentine Delegation for modifying paragraph 9 is correct. We only note that we should use the concept "informal economy" instead of "informal sector," in line with the recommendations of the most recent International Conferences of Labour Statisticians (ICLS).

Paragraph 10 (Original):

We reiterate our commitment to protect women and children from economic exploitation and we call on the Ministers responsible for Education, Labour and Social Development to adopt coordinated national strategies to prevent and eradicate child labour by 2020, **and to eliminate the worst forms of it** ~~child labour~~ **by 2015**, according to the **Hemispheric** Decent Work Agenda, and develop innovative strategies to bring children back into healthy learning environments **along with measures geared to ensuring their appropriate transition from education to working life**. We also reiterate our commitment to eliminate forced labour before 2010.

We support the modification of paragraph 10 suggested by Brazil, which incorporates into the original text the target of eradicating the worst forms of child labour by 2015. We merely propose a slight change in the language.

We also believe it is necessary to include a reference to measures to ensure a successful transition from education into the workplace, since the young adolescent segment, particularly those aged from 15 to 17, are generally not covered by policy measures and are not subjects of rights, including the right to adequate incorporation into the labour market.

New Paragraph (Original):

We recognise the importance of promoting decent work for young people, through better opportunities for their adequate incorporation into labour market, which is a decisive element in eradicating poverty, supporting social cohesion, and furthering development within democracy. To that end, we commit to supporting our labour ministries so they design and execute policies and National Action Plans to promote decent work and productive jobs for young people, with the participation of workers', employers', and youth organisations, in order to tackle the challenges of employability, youth enterprises, and social protection, with emphasis on the most vulnerable youth groups.

The main reference to measures aimed at integral youth development is in paragraph 27 of the Draft Declaration of Commitment. We believe that the section of the Declaration covering "Work and Employment" cannot fail to mention the promotion of decent for youth. The quality of the incorporation of young people of both sexes into the labour market, and particularly of their first jobs, is a key factor in the development of positive career paths. For that reason it is vital that we tackle the challenges of employability, entrepreneurship, and social protection for the young people of the Americas. Young people with access to productive jobs and decent work create progress and help cement democracy and social peace.

It should be noted that this year has been declared the "Ibero-American Year of Youth," and that the next Summit of Heads of State and Government, to be held in El Salvador on October 29-31, has "Youth and Development" as its topic.

ILO's proposal of a new paragraph to be inserted into the Declaration of commitments of Port-of-Spain ("Energy security and green jobs"; to be placed between paragraph 35 and 36)

We recognize that the expansion of clean energy systems can help to generate so-called green jobs. The extension of the global market of products and environmental services – in particular those which refer to energy efficiency, renewable energy sources and clean technologies – could contribute to employment growth and this would benefit a large part of the population in need, especially young people, women and agricultural workers. In order to avail of a potential to create employment which helps to protect the eco systems and the biodiversity (green jobs) – through reduction of energy consume, material and water and dependence of carbon – measures are required to face up to the existing bottle necks concerning professional qualification and satisfy the requirements of training of employers and workers in this booming sector of activity. It is necessary to recognize that green jobs do not automatically constitute decent work; thus, it is necessary to increase the quality of employment and the income in industries like the recycling industry and biomass energy industry. We consider that the ILO can help to fill the gap of knowledge with regard to the formulation of adequate policies in this subject matter, in the framework of its initiative "Green Jobs".

IX. COMMENTS OF THE INSTITUTE FOR CONNECTIVITY IN THE AMERICAS (ICA)

Paragraph 28 (Original):

We believe it is essential that the technological gap, both among and within the nations of the Americas, be reduced. We, therefore, renew our commitment to collaborate with regional, sub-regional and multinational agencies to advance progress in the implementation of initiatives under the Agenda for Connectivity in the Americas and the Plan of Action of Quito. We instruct our Ministers and High Level Authorities with responsibility for Information and Communication Technology (ICT) to promote **the adoption and effective use of ICTs through digital alfabetization initiatives and low-cost access programs aimed at reducing the digital divide.**